SJS 44 (Rev. 12/07, NJ 5/08)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

3785

CIVIL CUVER SILES

The pherein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided to the clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating to the clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating to the clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating to the court for the court for the purpose of initiating to the court for the The JS 44 civil cover sheet and the information of by local rules of court. This form, approved the civil docket sheet.

	NSTRUCTIONS IN THE REVERSE OF THE FORM.)		M
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS		DEFENDANTS	
SABRINA NELSON		PATENAUDE &	FELIX, A.P.C.
(b) County of Residence	of First Listed Plainting Philadelphia	County of Residence o	of First Listed Defendant
(c) Attorney's (Firm Na	me, Address, Telephone Number and Email Add	ress) NOTE: IN LAND	D CONDEMNATION CASES, USE THE LOCATION OF THE
Craig Thor Kimmel, E Kimmel & Silverman,		LAND I	INVOLVED.
30 E. Butler Pike	F. G .	Attorneys (If Known)	
Ambler, PA 19002 (215) 540-8888		_	
II. BASIS OF JURISE	(Place an "X" in One Box Only)	III. CITIZENSHIP OF P	PRINCIPAL PARTIES(Place an "X" in One Box for Plaintif
1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	3 Federal Question (U.S. Government Not a Party)		and One Box for Defendant) TF DEF 1
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant	☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of Another State	2 Incorporated and Principal Place 5 5 5 of Business In Another State
		Citizen or Subject of a Foreign Country	1 3
IV. NATURE OF SUI	T (Place an "X" in One Box Only)		School Delivery
☐ 110 Insurance	TORTS PERSONAL INJURY PERSONAL INJUR		□ 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 □ 400 State Reapportionment
☐ 120 Marine ☐ 130 Miller Act ☐ 140 Negotiable Instrument	☐ 310 Airplane ☐ 362 Personal Injury ☐ 315 Airplane Product	- de 620 Other Food & Drug ce 625 Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881	☐ 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 ☐ 430 Banks and Banking ☐ 450 Commerce
☐ 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgmen	t Slander 🗖 368 Asbestos Person	al 🗖 640 R.R. & Truck	PROPERTY/RIGHTS → 460 Deportation ☐ 820 Copyrights ☐ 470 Racketeer Influenced and
☐ 151 Medicare Act ☐ 152 Recovery of Defaulted	330 Federal Employers' Injury Product Liability Liability	☐ 650 Airline Regs. ☐ 660 Occupational	□ 830 Patent Corrupt Organizations □ 840 Trademark ■ 480 Consumer Credit
Student Loans (Excl. Veterans)	☐ 340 Marine PERSONAL PROPER ☐ 345 Marine Product ☐ 370 Other Fraud	Safety/Health 690 Other	490 Cable/Sat TV 810 Selective Service
☐ 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits	Liability 371 Truth in Lending 350 Motor Vehicle 380 Other Personal	g	☐ 861 HIA (1395ff) Exchange
☐ 160 Stockholders' Suits ☐ 190 Other Contract	☐ 355 Motor Vehicle Property Damag Product Liability ☐ 385 Property Damag		☐ 862 Black Lung (923) ☐ 875 Customer Challenge ☐ 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) ☐ 12 USC 3410
☐ 195 Contract Product Liability ☐ 196 Franchise			☐ 864 SSID Title XVI ☐ 865 RS1 (405(g)) ☐ 890 Other Statutory Actions ☐ 891 Agricultural Acts
REAL PROPERTY	CIVIL RIGHTS PRISONER PETITIO	NS 740 Railway Labor Act	FEDERAL TAX SUITS 3 892 Economic Stabilization Ac
☐ 210 Land Condemnation☐ 220 Foreclosure	☐ 441 Voting ☐ 510 Motions to Vaca ☐ 442 Employment Sentence	☐ 791 Empl. Ret. Inc.	or Defendant) 🗖 894 Energy Allocation Act
 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 	Accommodations Habeas Corpus: 530 General	Security Act	871 IRS—Third Party 26 USC 7609 895 Freedom of Information Act
 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property 	☐ 444 Welfare ☐ 535 Death Penalty ☐ 445 Amer. w/Disabilities - ☐ 540 Mandamus & O	immigration Other 462 Naturalization Application	
2 270 7 m. Odler Rom 7 roperty	Employment	☐ 463 Habeas Corpus -	to Justice 550 Constitutionality of
	Other	465 Other Immigration	State Statutes
	440 Other Civil Rights	Actions	
🔀 1 Original 🗇 2 1		1 4 Kellistateu ol 1 3 anoth	Appeal to District
Proceeding S	Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you	Reopened	aif.) Litigation Indoment
YA. CAUSE OF ACT	Fair Debt Collection Practices		
VII. REQUESTED I			CHECK YES only if demanded in complaint: JURY DEMAND: Yes No
VIII. RELATED CA	SE(S) (See instructions): JUDGE		DOCKET NUMBER
Explanation: 06/18	/2014 /s Cra	ig Thor Kimmel CTK 3654	4 1 9 2014
DATE	SIGNATURE	OF ATTORNEY OF RECORD	JUN 1 5 ZM 19
			7/4
			1900

Case 2:14-cv-03785-TON Document 1 Filed 06/19/14 Page 2 of 11

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

LVANIA — DESIGNATION FORM to be used by counsel to indicate the category of the case for the purpose of

Address of Plaintiff: 7010 Grays	Avenue, Philadelphia,	PA 19142	14 3	785
Address of Defendant: 213 East M	ain Street, Carnegie,	PA 15106	1 3 0	.00
Place of Accident, Incident or Transaction:		/		
	(Use Reverse Side For A			
	ntal corporate party with any parent corporation a	,	-	?
(Attach two copies of the Disclosure Statem	nent Form in accordance with Fed.R.Civ.P. 7.1(a)	Yes	No. K	
Does this case involve multidistrict litigation	possibilities?	Yes□	No. M	
RELATED CASE, IF ANY:				
Case Number:	Judge	Date Terminated:		
Civil cases are deemed related when yes is an	swered to any of the following questions:			
I. Is this case related to property included in	an earlier numbered suit pending or within one y	ear previously terminated action in thi	s court?	
		Yes□	NoX	
2. Does this case involve the same issue of faction in this court?	act or grow out of the same transaction as a prior	suit pending or within one year previo	usly terminated	
		Yes□	No⊠	
·	ngement of a patent already in suit or any earlier	• •	·	
terminated action in this court?		Yes□	No⊠	
4. Is this case a second or successive habeas	corpus, social security appeal, or pro se civil rigi	nts case filed by the same individual?		
	,	Yes□	No⊠	
CIVIL: (Place in ONE CATEGORY O	NLY)			
A. Federal Question Cases:		B. Diversity Jurisdiction Ca		
1. □ Indemnity Contract, Marine (Contract, and All Other Contracts	1. □ Insurance Contrac	t and Other Contracts	
2. □ FELA		□ Airplane Personal	Injury	
3. □ Jones Act-Personal Injury		3. □ Assault, Defamation	on	
4. □ Antitrust		4. □ Marine Personal I	njury	
5. □ Patent		5. D Motor Vehicle Per	rsonal Injury	
6. Labor-Management Relation	S	6. □ Other Personal In	jury (Please specify)	
7. Civil Rights		7. D Products Liability	•	
8. ☐ Habeas Corpus		8. Products Liability	— Asbestos	
9. □ Securities Act(s) Cases		9. D All other Diversity	y Cases	
10. Social Security Review Case	s	(Please specify)		
11. M All other Federal Question C (Please specify) 15 U.S.C				
	ARBITRATION CER	TIFICATION		
	(Check Appropriate	Category)	JUN 1 9 2014	
<u> , Craig Thor Kimmel</u>	counsel of record do hereby cer	tiry:		
□ Pursuant to Local Civil Rule 53.2, Se \$150,000.00 exclusive of interest and costs;	ction 3(c)(2), that to the best of my knowledge an	d belief, the damages recoverable in the	ils civil action case exceed t	ne sum or
□ Relief other than monetary damages				
			57100	
DATE: 06/18/2014	Craig Thor Kimmel			
NOT	Attorney-at-Law E: A trial de novo will be a trial by jury only if t		Attorney I.D.# P. 38.	
				_
I certify that, to my knowledge, the withit except as noted above.	n case is not related to any case now pending	or within one year previously termin	nated action in this court	
	Grand or Minera with and I		57100	
DATE: 06/18/2014	Craig Thor Kimmel Attorney-at-Law		Attorney I.D.#	-
	' I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	•		

CIV. 609 (5/2012)



IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA

CASE MANAGEMENT TRACK DESIGNATION FORM

SABRINA NELSON	:	CIVIL ACTION
v.	:	14 3785
PATENAUDE & FELIX,	A.P.C.	NO.

In accordance with the Civil Justice Expense and Delay Reduction Plan of this court, counsel for plaintiff shall complete a Case Management Track Designation Form in all civil cases at the time of filing the complaint and serve a copy on all defendants. (See § 1:03 of the plan set forth on the reverse side of this form.) In the event that a defendant does not agree with the plaintiff regarding said designation, that defendant shall, with its first appearance, submit to the clerk of court and serve on the plaintiff and all other parties, a Case Management Track Designation Form specifying the track to which that defendant believes the case should be assigned.

SELECT ONE OF THE FOLLOWING CASE MANAGEMENT TRACKS:

(a)	Habeas Corpus – Cases brought under 28 U.S.C. § 2241 through § 2255.	()
(b)	Social Security – Cases requesting review of a decision of the Secretary of Health and Human Services denying plaintiff Social Security Benefits.	4
(c)	Arbitration – Cases required to be designated for arbitration under Local Civil Rule 53.2.	(x)
(d)	Asbestos – Cases involving claims for personal injury or property damage from exposure to asbestos.	(1)
(e)	Special Management – Cases that do not fall into tracks (a) through (d) that are commonly referred to as complex and that need special or intense management by	

management cases.)	()
(f) Standard Management – Cases that do not fall into any one of the other tracks	(`

06/18/2014	Craig Thor Kimmel	SABRINA NELSON	
Date	Attorney-at-law	Attorney for	
215-540-8888	877-788-2864	kimmel@creditlaw.com	

Telephone FAX Number E-Mail Address

the court. (See reverse side of this form for a detailed explanation of special

(Civ. 660) 10/02

JUN 1 9 2014

H00.00

TON

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA



SABRINA NELSON,)
Plaintiff	14 3785
v.) Case No.:
PATENAUDE & FELIX, A.P.C.,) COMPLAINT AND DEMAND FOR
Defendant) JURY TRIAL)
) (Unlawful Debt Collection Practices) [[[[

COMPLAINT

SABRINA NELSON ("Plaintiff"), by her attorneys, KIMMEL & SILVERMAN, P.C., alleges the following against PATENAUDE & FELIX, A.P.C. ("Defendant"):

INTRODUCTION

1. Plaintiff's Complaint is based on the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692 et seq. ("FDCPA").

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. Jurisdiction of this court arises pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d), which states that such actions may be brought and heard before "any appropriate United States district court without regard to the amount in controversy," and 28 U.S.C. § 1331 grants this court original jurisdiction of all civil actions arising under the laws of the United States.
- 3. Defendant conducts business in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and therefore, personal jurisdiction is established.



7

9

15

16

17 18

19

2021

22

24

23

25

4. Venue is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2).

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff is a natural person residing in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19142.
- 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(3).
- 7. Defendant is a national debt collection company with its main office located at 4545 Murphy Canyon Road, 3rd Floor, San Diego, California 92123, and having an office located at 213 East Main Street, Carnegie, Pennsylvania 15106.
- 8. Defendant is a "debt collector" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(6), and repeatedly contacted Plaintiff in an attempt to collect a debt.
- 9. Defendant acted through its agents, employees, officers, members, directors, heirs, successors, assigns, principals, trustees, sureties, subrogees, representatives, and insurers.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 10. At all relevant times, Defendant was attempting to collect an alleged consumer debt from Plaintiff.
- 11. The alleged debt, a GE Capital Retail Bank personal credit card account, arose out of transactions, which were primarily for personal, family, or household purposes.
- 12. Beginning in or around June 2013, and continuing through September 2013, Defendant repeatedly and continuously contacted Plaintiff on her home and cellular telephones in its attempts to collect a debt.
- 13. Defendant contacted Plaintiff, on average, at least once a day and at times calling more than twice a day in its attempts to collect a debt.
- 14. During the relevant period, Plaintiff received more than ten (10) collection calls a week from Defendant.

- 15. In those instances where Plaintiff answered Defendant's calls, Defendant demanded payment of more than \$4,400.00.
- 16. Plaintiff informed Defendant that she was unemployed, could not make payment, and to stop calling.
- 17. In response, Defendant's collector stated that he did not care if she doesn't work and claimed she could pay.
- 18. Further, Defendant's collector threatened legal action and told Plaintiff that she doesn't have the money for a lawyer, so it's better if she pays.
- 19. Upon information and belief, at the time Defendant threatened legal action, it did not intend to take the action it threatened, and to date, Defendant has not taken any legal action against Plaintiff.
 - 20. In addition, Defendant failed to update its records to stop the calls to Plaintiff.
- 21. Rather, Defendant continued calling Plaintiff in its attempts to collect the alleged debt.
- 22. Upon information and belief, when calling Plaintiff, Defendant did not possess information or have a reasonable belief that Plaintiff's financial situation and employment status had changed which would allow her to make payment.
- 23. Defendant's purpose in calling Plaintiff was to annoy, abuse and harass her, believing that it would likely cause Plaintiff to make payment on the alleged debt.
- 24. Lastly, in its attempts to collect a debt, on June 25, 2013, Defendant sent Plaintiff written correspondence stating that a debt had been "assigned to this firm to initiate collection efforts regarding [her] delinquent outstanding balance to [its] client." See Exhibit A, Defendant's June 25, 2013, letter.

- 25. The letter is purportedly from Gregg L. Morris, Esquire at Defendant. <u>See</u> Exhibit A.
- 26. The letter was purportedly signed by Gregg L. Morris, Esquire (hereinafter "Attorney Morris"). See Exhibit A.
- 27. Upon information and belief, that is not the "signature" of Attorney Morris on the June 25, 2013, letter to Plaintiff; rather, it is an autopen or computer printing of his name.
- 28. The collection letter was not prepared, reviewed, or sent by Attorney Morris as the letter indicates.
- 29. Upon information and belief, the collection notice was prepared and sent by other individuals employed by Defendant.
- 30. The letter deceptively conveys review and involvement by Attorney Morris, when he had none.
- 31. Upon information and belief, Attorney Morris was not involved in the collection of Plaintiff's debt.
- 32. Further, Defendant's letter falsely, deceptively and/or misleadingly represents that Attorney Morris had authored the letter, when he did not.
- 33. Defendant has been sued prior to the instant case for the identical violation in the case of <u>Kathleen Taylor v. Patenaude & Felix, A.P.C., et al.</u>, No. 2:13-cv-01281 (E.D. Pa. March 11, 2013).

DEFENDANT VIOLATED THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

34. In its actions to collect a disputed debt, Defendant violated the FDCPA in the following ways:

COUNT I

- a. A debt collector violates § 1692d of the FDCPA by engaging in conduct the natural consequence of which is to harass, oppress, or abuse any person in connection with the collection of a debt.
- b. A debt collector violates § 1692d(5) of the FDCPA by causing a telephone to ring or engaging any person in telephone conversation repeatedly or continuously with intent to annoy, abuse, or harass any person at the called number.
- c. Here, Defendant violated §§ 1692d and 1692d(5) of the FDCPA when it repeatedly called Plaintiff on her home and cellular telephones, at least, once a day and sometimes calling more than twice a day, as well as continuing to call Plaintiff after having been told to stop calling and that she did not have the means to pay the debt.

COUNT II

- a. A debt collector violates § 1692e of the FDCPA by using any false, deceptive, or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- b. A debt collector violates §1692e(3) of the FDCPA by falsely representing or implicating that any individual is an attorney or that any communication is from an attorney.

- c. A debt collector violates § 1692e(5) of the FDCPA by threatening to take any action that cannot legally be taken or that is not intended to be taken.
- d. Section 1692e(9) of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from using or distributing any written communication which simulates or is falsely represented to by a document authorized, issued, or approved by any court, official, or agency of the United States or any State, or which creates a false impression as to its source, authorization, or approval.
- e. A debt collector violates § 1692e(10) of the FDCPA by using any false representation or deceptive means to collect or attempt to collect any debt or to obtain information concerning a consumer.
- f. Here, Defendant violated §§ 1692e, 1692e(3), 1692e(5), 1692e(9) and 1692e(10) of the FDCPA sending correspondence which created the false impression that the correspondence was written by an attorney and that the communication was from an attorney, when it was not; by stating Gregg Morris, Esquire had written the letter, when he did not; and threatening suit against Plaintiff when it did not intend to take the action threatened.

COUNT III

- a. A debt collector violates § 1692f of the FDCPA by using unfair or unconscionable means to collect or attempt to collect any debt.
- b. Here, Defendant violated § 1692f of the FDCPA by failing to update its records and continuing to call Plaintiff's home and cellular telephones after being told that she lost her job, she does not have any money, and to stop calling.

1	WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, SABRINA NELSON, respectfully pray for a judgment a
2	follows:
3 4	a. All actual damages suffered pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(a)(1);
5 6 7 8	 b. Statutory damages of \$1,000.00 for the violation of the FDCPA pursuan to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(a)(2)(A); c. All reasonable attorneys' fees, witness fees, court costs and other litigation costs incurred by Plaintiff pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1693k(a)(3); and d. Any other relief deemed appropriate by this Honorable Court.
10 11	
12	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL
13	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff, SABRINA NELSON, demands a jury trial in
14	this case.
15	RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,
16	Date: June 18, 2014 By: _/s Craig Thor Kimmel CTK 3654
17	CRAIG THOR KIMMEL PA ID No. 57100
18	Kimmel & Silverman, P.C. 30 E. Butler Pike
20	Ambler, PA 19002 Phone: (215) 540-8888 Fave (877) 788 2864
21	Fax: (877) 788-2864 Email: kimmel@creditlaw.com
22	
23	
24	
25	
	7

LAW OFFICES OF

Patenaude & Felix, a.p.c.

A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION

4549 MURPHY CANYON RD., 3RD FL 8AN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123 TEL (858) 244-7600 (800) 892-7675 FAX (458) 838-0118 213 EAST MAIN TREET CARNEGIE, PEN BYLVAJIA 16108 TEL (412) 429-76 5 (556) 772-7675 FAX (412) 429-71 8 1711 EAST FLAMINGD RD., STE. 112A LAS VEGAS, NEVADA 38119 TEL (702) 952-2032 (800) 867-3092 FAX (702) 932-8286 522 EW 6th AVENUE, STE. 1300 PORTLAND OREGON 97264 TEL (503) 208-2676 (800) 832-7676 2200 6th AVENUE, 8TE. 790 SEATILE, WASHINGTON 96121 TEL (206) 441-4069 (800) 832-7675 FAX (206) 441-5475

June 25, 2013

SABRINA NELSON

RE: Our Client:

E CAPITAL RETAIL BANK (7501-7)

Issued as:

Climate Select

Account Number:

XXXXXXXXXXXX3964

Our File Number:

113-20125

Balance Due:

\$4,402.53

Dear Sabrina Nelson:

Please be advised that the above-referenced debt has been assigned to this firm to initiate collection efforts regarding your delinquent outstanding balance to our client. If you wish to eliminate further collection action, please contact us at (866) 772-7675.

Unless you notify this office within THIRTY (30) days of receiving this notice that you dispute the validity of this debt, or any position thereof, this office will assume this debt is valid.

If you notify this office in writing within THIRTY (30) days of receiving this notice that this debt, or any portion thereof, is disputed, this office will obtain verification of the debt, or a copy of a judgment against you, and mail you a copy of such verification or judgment. Further, if you make a written request upon this office within THIRTY (30) days of receiving this notice, this office will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor.

This is an attempt to collect a lebt and any information obtained will be used for that purpose.

Very truly yours,

LAW OFFICE OF PATENAUDE & FELIX

ARM

GREGG L. MORRIS, ESQ.

THIS COMMUNICATION IS FROM A DEBT COLLECTOR

PF_03 Ltr Initial Demand

P&F File No. 13-20125

